

FOREST RESEARCH INSTITUTE DEEMED to be UNIVERSITY

Minutes of the Meeting of Board of Management held on 13th September, 2018

The Meeting of the Board of Management was held on 13.09.2018 at 11:00 a.m. in the Conference Hall of FRI Deemed to be University. Besides the Chairperson, Dr. Savita, Director, FRI & Vice Chancellor, FRI Deemed to be University following were present in the meeting:-

Dr. Devendra Pandey, Retd. PCCF & DG, FSI	-	Member
Sh. C.S. Joshi, Retd. PCCF	-	Member
Dr. Neelu Gera, IFS, DDG (Education), ICFRE	-	Member
Dr. G.S. Randhawa, Retd. Professor, IIT Roorkee	-	Member
Prof. Salil K Tewari, Jt. Director, G.B. Pant University	-	Member
Prof. P.P. Dhyani, VC, SGRR University	-	Member
Dr. H.S. Ginwal, Dean (Academic), FRI Deemed to be University	-	Ex-Officio Member
Dr. Santan Barthwal, Scientist -F, G&TP Division, FRI	-	Member
Dr. Maneesh Singh Bhandari, Scientist -D, G&TP Division, FRI	-	Member
Dr. Pratima Patel, Controller of Examination, FRIDU	-	Member
Dr. A.K. Tripathi, Registrar, FRI Deemed to be University	-	Member Secretary

At the outset, Dr. Savita, Director, FRI & Vice-Chancellor, FRI Deemed to be University (Chairperson) welcomed the members of the Board of Management. Thereafter, with the permission of the Chair, the Registrar, FRI Deemed to be University (Member Secretary) presented the agenda items before the Board of Management.

Agenda Item No. 12/2018:- To confirm the minutes and compliance report of the meeting of the Board of Management held on 02.01.2018.

Resolution No. 12/2018 : The Honorable members having gone through the agenda, confirmed the minutes and compliance report of the resolutions passed by the Board of Management in its meeting held on 2.1.2018.


Agenda Item No. 13/2018 :- To formally pass the grace for award of Degrees to the Ph.D. Scholars and M.Sc. students.

Resolution No. 13/2018 : The members having considered the agenda No. 13/2018, **resolved** to pass the grace for award of Ph.D. Degree to 20 successful Research Scholars as per the list at Annexure -2 of the agenda, provided all the procedures/rules of FRI Deemed University have been complied with. The members further passed the grace and approved for award of Degrees to the students of M.Sc. courses as per the list at Annexure -3, 4, 5, and 6 of the agenda. The course-wise numbers of awardees are as under:-

Ph.D. in Forestry	-	20	Annexure-2
M.Sc. Forestry (2016-2018) batch	-	39	} Annexure-3
M.Sc. Forestry (2015-2018) batch	-	02	
M.Sc. Environment Management (2016-2018) batch	-	40	} Annexure -4
M.Sc. Environment Management (2014-2018) batch	-	01	
M.Sc. Environment Management (2015-2018) batch	-	01	
M.Sc. Wood Science & Technology (2016-2018) batch	-	35	Annexure-5
M.Sc. Cellulose & Paper Technology (2016-2018) batch	-	10	Annexure-6

The members of the BOM suggested that after serving the agenda, the name of additional Scholars or students should either be placed as supplementary agenda or in the agenda itself the chances of inclusion of more scholars or students may be reflected before circulation.


(A.K. Tripathi)
Member Secretary, Board of Management
Registrar,
FRI Deemed to be University


(Savita)
Chairperson, Board of Management
Director, FRI & Vice-Chancellor
FRI Deemed to be University

Dr. P.P. Dhyani one of the eminent members of Board of Management has suggested for preparing a subject-wise compendium of the Ph.D. awardees of FRI Deemed to be University.

Finally, it was resolved that the Director, FRI & Vice-Chancellor, FRI Deemed to be University may explore the possibility of compilation of information regarding the Ph.Ds awarded by FRI Deemed to be University.

Agenda Item No. 14/2018 :- To consider the matter regarding award of Ph.D. Degree to Shri G.S. Rawat (IFS Retd.), Ex-Ph.D. Scholar of FRIDU in the light of the Judgment of Hon'ble High Court, Nainital on writ petition No.369(S/B) of 2011 (G.S. Rawat vs FRI (Deemed University) & Others

Resolution No. 14/2018 : The agenda was discussed at a great length and depth in the light of the Judgment of Hon'ble High Court, Nainital on writ petition No.369(S/B) of 2011 (G.S. Rawat vs FRI (Deemed University) & Others and also in the light of the resolution No. 3/2018 passed by Board of Management in its meeting held on 02.01.2018. All the members unanimously (except Shri C.S. Joshi one of the eminent members of Board of Management) **resolved** to constitute a committee to **advise on the issue of withdrawal of the Ph.D. degree awarded to the petitioner (Sh. G.S. Rawat) to comply with the second operative part of the judgment of the Hon'ble High court as judgment of the Hon'ble High Court is based on the ground that there has been occasioned gross violation of the principle of natural justice and have not gone into any other contentions and left it open to the competent body to take steps and in which case, the Hon'ble High Court has left open all the contentions available to the petitioner also. The Hon'ble High Court has not pronounced on other contentions which have been raised by the respondents as regards the merits of the matter.** The recommendation of this committee may be placed again in the meeting of Board of Management. The dissent note submitted by Sh. C.S. Joshi, through e-mail dated 13.09.2018 is as below and also attached with the minutes as Annexure -I.

Sh. C.S. Joshi one of the Board of Management member viz. Shri C. S. Joshi requested for recording his dissenting views in the matter stating *inter alia* as under:

- a. The degree was withdrawn pursuant to Board of Management resolution of 14/07/2011, which itself has become null and void as per Honourable High Court's decision dated 20/11/2017. The Ph. D. degree to Shri G. S. Rawat stands restored. This has been unconditionally resolved in the BoM meeting of 17/01/2018 and the consequential orders have been issued by the competent authority, again unconditionally. Likewise, the decisions in the matter taken in the year 2005 stand today. The finality of the case had been placed on record by the then Chancellor and DG,ICFRE vide his letter of 30/01/2006. As such there do not seem to be any regulations/ established procedure for reviewing such cases. The case may become hopelessly time barred at this juncture and may not stand legal scrutiny.
- b. The main bone of contention had been procedural infirmities for which the Institute as well as the person seeking award of degree are equally responsible. In the instant case alleged infirmities on the part Shri G. S. Rawat are said to be moral/ ethical. As such the substance part of the thesis including its academic contents were never disputed. Shri G. S. Rawat was asked to give his say in the matter through a written communication dated 28/06/2004 to which



(A.K. Tripathi)

Member Secretary, Board of Management
Registrar,
FRI Deemed to be University



(Savita)

Chairperson, Board of Management
Director, FRI & Vice-Chancellor
FRI Deemed to be University

he replied on 27/07/2004, which was placed on record of the Institute. The matter was discussed in Board of Management dated 18/10/2004 which directed that it should first be referred to RDC, by then reconstituted. Shri G. S. Rawat had no say in this RDC. The RDC resolved to approve his Ph.D. degree w.e.f. 2002 after due consideration of the facts. From the records furnished to Board of Management it is obvious that Shri G. S. Rawat had not solicited the degree from a previous date. This was subsequently discussed in the Board of Management on 18/11/2005 which authorized the Chancellor to take the final decision which he did. Apparently the Chancellor had the authority in the matter, especially when he had been explicitly authorized by Board of Management. There are no statutory provisions to override the decisions of the Chancellor in such cases, that too after lapse of nearly one and a half decade. Now this being the sequence of events and having already obtained Shri G. S. Rawat's say in the matter no purpose would be served by seeking his say again. The matter should therefore be closed. On the contrary efforts should be focused on devising foolproof methods for warding off such controversies which damage the reputation of the institute as well as the research scholar. It would be essential to revisit the latest regulations of the UGC and bring the MoAs adapted by the Institute in conformity with the statutory provisions.

- c. The Hon'ble High Court while disposing off the Writ Petition has not ordered for withdrawal of Ph.D. degree. It has stated that "*we also leave it open to the competent body to take steps, if advised, to withdraw the Ph.D. degree awarded to the petitioner, in which case, we leave open all the contentions available to the petitioner also.*" No doubt the Court order does not foreclose our options but the moot question is do we consider it appropriate and legally sustainable to withdraw the degree, especially when it has been restored unconditionally as per Board of Management decision of 02/01/2018. The other issue is who is competent to "advise" the Board of Management when it has already restored the Ph.D. degree. Any move to withdraw the degree at this juncture would prove an avoidable, futile, expensive and time barred exercise with collateral damage to the Institute's reputation. Hence, the case needs to be closed and no further action is warranted in the matter."

Agenda Item No.15/2018 :- To consider the request of creation of Corpus fund of Rs.6,00,000/-(Six Lakhs) by Dr. G.S. Randhawa, Former Professor, IIT Roorkee for establishing an Annual Cash Award of Rs.30000/-(Thirty Thousand) to the Ph.D. Scholar of FRIDU having best Ph.D. Thesis

Resolution No. 15/2018 : The Board of Management accepted the request of Dr. G.S. Randhawa and **resolved** to create a corpus fund of Rs.6,00,000/-(Six Lakhs) by Dr. Randhawa in the name of FRI Deemed to be University for establishing an annual cash award (Professor Puran Singh cash award) of approx. Rs.30,000/- (out of accrued interest) in the honor of Prof. Puran Singh an eminent writer of English, Hindi and Punjabi and a Scientist and freedom fighter who has served FRI as Imperial Chemist from 1907 to 1918, to the selected Ph.D. Scholar having best thesis of FRI Deemed to be University. All the members of Board of Management appreciated and applauded the benevolent gesture of Dr. G.S. Randhawa and the Chairperson personally thanked Dr. Randhawa for his support for the Ph.D. scholar of FRI Deemed to be University.

Further, for selection of best thesis the Board of Management has also **resolved** and authorized Director, FRI & Vice-Chancellor, FRI Deemed to be University to constitute a five members committee every year for the selection of best thesis. The annual calendar shall be from the date of creation of corpus. The thesis submitted after the date of creation of corpus shall only be considered.


(A.K. Tripathi)
Member Secretary, Board of Management
Registrar,
FRI Deemed to be University


(Savita)
Chairperson, Board of Management
Director, FRI & Vice-Chancellor
FRI Deemed to be University

It is also asked by the BOM to nominate one of the members of the BOM in the committee to be constituted for purpose.

It is also **resolved that** no research scholar should be registered under a Scientist/Forest Officer who is going to retire or whose tenure of deputation is going to expire within 3 years from the date of registration.

Agenda Item No. 16/2018 :- To consider the resolutions of meeting of Finance Committee held on 10.07.2018 regarding passing of Annual Account Expenditure, Balance Sheet for the year 2017-2018 and Estimated expenditure for the year 2018-2019

Resolution No. 16/2018 : The Board of Management **resolved** to approve the Annual Account Expenditure, Balance Sheet for the year 2017-2018 and accepted the auditor's report regarding Balance Sheet, Income expenditure & Receipt & Payment statement placed as Annexure-8.

As regard, the approval of Estimated expenditure for the year 2018-2019 the Board of Management has **resolved** to defer it and suggested to prepare a statement on expected receipts and expenditures for the year 2018-2019 and to send it to all the members of the Board of Management for its consideration in next Board of Management meeting. Shri C.S. Joshi one of the eminent members of Board of Management desired to study the auditor's report in detail therefore the copy of same will be sent to him.

Agenda Item No. 17/2018 :- To consider the recommendation of the Fee review committee constituted to review the fee structure of Ph.D. Programme.

Resolution No. 17/2018 : The Board of Management having gone through the recommendation of the fee committee and resolved to enhance the Fee for Ph.D. Programme of FRI Deemed to be University for Indian & International scholars as under:-

Indian Scholars Fee structure

Fee structure	Approved (in Rs.)
Fee to be deposited at the time of initial reporting	
Compulsory Course fee (to be paid to respective research centres)	6500/-
Library Fee	3000/-
Caution Money (Refundable) (to be paid to respective research centres)	5000/-
Fee to be deposited at the time of Registration after Synopsis Seminar	
Registration/Enrolment Fee	20000/-
Annual fee (to be deposited till submission of thesis)	13000/-
Cultural/Sports/Magazine (Name to be changed as Misc. fee)	3000/-
Laboratory fee (to be charged by the research centers concerned annually for first two years of registration)	7000/-
Library fee per year (to be paid to respective research centers till submission of thesis)	3000/-
Late fee	1000/-


(A.K. Tripathi)

Member Secretary, Board of Management
Registrar,
FRI Deemed to be University


(Savita)

Chairperson, Board of Management
Director, FRI & Vice-Chancellor
FRI Deemed to be University

Other fees	
Renewal of Registration fee	2500/-
Thesis fee (to be deposited at the time of submission of thesis)	20000/-
Revision of Thesis fee	3000/-
Viva-Voce exam fee (to be deposited at the time of submission of thesis)	3000/-
Provisional Degree Fee & Degree Fee (to be deposited at the time of submission of thesis)	500/-
Transcript fee (maximum upto 5 copies) and more than 5 @ Rs.500/- per copy	1000/-

International Ph.D. Scholars

The scholars from the neighbouring countries viz. Nepal, Bangladesh, Bhutan, Sri Lanka, Afghanistan, Pakistan & Maldives may pay following fee. The sponsored candidates will have to pay 25% more for all the items.

Items	Recommended Fee Structure for neighboring countries (in Indian Rupees)
Registration / Enrolment Fee	50000/-
Foreign Scholar Fee	withdrawn
Cultural/Sports/Magazine (Name to be changed as Misc. fee)	3000/-
Annual fee (till submission of thesis)	20,000/-
Laboratory fee (to be charged annually for first two years of registration and to be paid to respective research centers)	15000/-
Library fee (till submission of thesis) (to be paid to respective research centers)	6000/-
Caution Money (Refundable)	10000/-
Late fee	2000/-
Renewal of registration fee	6000/-
Thesis Fee	40000/-
Compulsory Course Fee	15000/-
Revision of thesis fee	10000/-
Viva-Voce exam fee (to be deposited at the time of submission of thesis)	10000/-
Provisional Degree Fee & Degree Fee (to be deposited at the time of submission of thesis)	1000/-
Transcript fee (maximum upto 5 copies) and more than 5 @ Rs.500/- per copy	2000/-

The enhanced fee shall be applicable on the scholar admitted since September 2018.



(A.K. Tripathi)
Member Secretary, Board of Management
Registrar,
FRI Deemed to be University



(Savita)
Chairperson, Board of Management
Director, FRI & Vice-Chancellor
FRI Deemed to be University

Further, the Board of Management accepting the recommendation of the fee committee also **resolved to withdraw** the following lines from the existing clause 5.8 (h) of Ph.D. Ordinance in case of foreign Ph.D. Scholar -

“In order to encourage Forestry research in neighboring countries the DG, ICFRE/Chairman B.O.M. FRI University may exempt up to fifty percent of the total fee provided the candidates apply for such exemption as per the procedure prescribed by the university. The University shall also lay down the procedure for assessing the proficiency of the foreign scholar in English language so that there is no problem in integrating the scholar with the existing system. The exemption will be subject to performance and evaluation by the concerned Research Advisory Committee. For supporting such foreign students, the ICFRE may provide appropriate grant to the FRI University. There will be no exemption for the sponsored candidates. In case of scholars from other countries the university may register them at twice the above fee structure pending finalization of separate fee structure”

Agenda Item No. 18/2018 :- To consider the issue of utilization of interest accrued upon corpus of FRIDU.

Resolution No. 18 /2018 : After detailed discussion the Board of Management has deferred the agenda and resolved to consider it in next meeting of Board of Management.

Agenda Item No. 19 /2018 :- To consider the grant-in-aid under forestry education provided by ICFRE


Resolution No. 19/2018 : The Board of Management has noted the information as given in Annexure-11 regarding utilization of Rs.80, 616/- for purchasing the books by Library. Registrar, FRI Deemed to be University informed the members that the budget was released in March, 2018 and the old version of books were not available that's why the full aid could not be utilized.

Supplementary Agenda-1/2018- To consider the proposal of Sarda Plywood Industries, Pvt. Ltd., Kolkota for award of fellowship to the student of M.Sc. Wood Science & Technology of FRI Deemed to be University

Resolution No. 1/2018:- The Board of Management has gone through the agenda and **resolved** to accept the request of Sarda Plywood Industries Limited for award of fellowship and award to the student of M.Sc. Wood Science & Technology Course as under:-

1. **Fellowship** – One student will get tuition fee for the course. The student who get the highest marks in Entrance Examination and admitted in M.Sc. Wood Science & Technology course in the year 2018.
2. **Award for M.Sc. Topper** – The topper of the M.Sc. Wood Science & Technology 2016-2018 batch will get a medal (Range INR 7500 – 10000) and a cash award of INR 11000.

The meeting then ended with vote of thanks by the Chairperson to all the members of the Board of Management.


A.K. Tripathi)
Member Secretary, Board of Management
Registrar,
FRI Deemed to be University


(Savita)
Chairperson, Board of Management
Director, FRI & Vice-Chancellor
FRI Deemed to be University